# 1 Spatiotemporal tools for emerging and endemic disease hotspots in small areas – an

# 2 analysis of dengue and chikungunya in Barbados, 2013 – 2016

- 3 Catherine A. Lippi<sup>1,2</sup>, Anna M. Stewart-Ibarra<sup>3</sup>, Moory Romero<sup>4</sup>, Avery Q.J. Hinds<sup>6</sup>, Rachel
- 4 Lowe<sup>6,7</sup>, Roché Mahon<sup>8</sup>, Cedric J. Van Meerbeeck<sup>8</sup>, Leslie Rollock<sup>9</sup>, Marquita Gittens-St.
- 5 Hilaire<sup>10</sup>, Adrian R. Trotman<sup>8</sup>, Dale Holligan<sup>9</sup>, Shane Kirton<sup>9</sup>, Mercy J. Borbor-Cordova<sup>11</sup>, and
- 6 Sadie J. Ryan<sup>1,2</sup>
- <sup>1</sup> Quantitative Disease Ecology and Conservation (QDEC) Lab Group, Department of Geography, University of
   Florida, Gainesville, FL, USA
- 9 <sup>2</sup> Emerging Pathogens Institute, University of Florida, Gainesville, FL, USA
- <sup>3</sup> InterAmerican Institute for Global Change Research (IAI), Montevideo, Department of Montevideo, Uruguay
- <sup>4</sup> State University of New York College of Environmental Science and Forestry (SUNY ESF), Department of
   Environmental Studies, Syracuse, NY, USA
- 13 <sup>5</sup> Caribbean Public Health Agency, Trinidad and Tobago
- <sup>6</sup>Centre on Climate Change & Planetary Health, Department of Infectious Disease Epidemiology, London School of
   Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London, UK
- <sup>7</sup>Barcelona Institute for Global Health, ISGlobal, Barcelona, Spain
- 17 <sup>8</sup> The Caribbean Institute for Meteorology and Hydrology, St. James, Barbados
- 18 <sup>9</sup> Ministry of Health and Wellness, St. Michael, Barbados
- <sup>10</sup> Faculty of Medical Sciences, University of the West Indies at Cave Hill, Bridgetown, Barbados
- 20 <sup>11</sup> Facultad de Ingeniería Marítima y Ciencias del Mar, Escuela Superior Politécnica del Litoral (ESPOL),
- 21 Guayaquil, Ecuador
- 22

- 24
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

# 29 Abstract

30	<b>Objective:</b> To detect potential hotspots of transmission of dengue and chikungunya in Barbados,
31	and assess impact of input surveillance data and methodology on observed patterns of risk.
32	Methods: Using two methods of cluster detection, Moran's I and spatial scan statistics, we
33	analyzed the geospatial and temporal distribution of disease cases and rates across Barbados for
34	dengue fever in 2013–2016, and a 2014 chikungunya outbreak.
35	Results: During years with high numbers of dengue cases, hotspots for cases were found with
36	Moran's I in south and central regions in 2013 and 2016, respectively. Using smoothed disease
37	rates, clustering was detected every year for dengue. Hotspots were not detected via spatial scan
38	statistics, but coldspots suggesting lower rates of disease activity were found in southwestern
39	Barbados during high case years of dengue.
40	Conclusions: Spatial analysis of surveillance data is useful in identifying outbreak hotspots,
41	complementing existing early warning systems. We caution that these methods should be used in
42	a manner appropriate to available data, and reflecting explicit public health goals – managing for
43	overall case numbers, or targeting anomalous rates for further investigation.

## 45 Introduction

Dengue fever threatens the health of communities throughout Latin America and the 46 47 Caribbean, where all four serotypes of dengue virus (DENV 1-4) are in circulation following a regional resurgence of the pathogen in the 1980s<sup>1,2</sup>. The Caribbean island of Barbados is 48 challenged with managing endemic dengue fever, and other febrile mosquito-borne diseases 49 including emerging chikungunya and Zika viral diseases <sup>3,4</sup>. In small island nations like 50 Barbados, outbreaks translate into increased morbidity and mortality, high costs to healthcare 51 systems, and lost economic productivity <sup>5–7</sup>. With approximately 40% of employment and gross 52 53 domestic product linked to the tourism industry, Barbados is particularly vulnerable to the economic impacts of arbovirus outbreaks<sup>8</sup>. In addition to lost domestic productivity, travel-54 55 related cases and negative health perceptions associated with outbreaks deter potential visitors, further impacting the livelihoods of island residents <sup>9,10</sup>. The emergence and subsequent 56 establishment of novel arboviruses in the Caribbean exacerbates matters by complicating disease 57 management while further impacting sources of income<sup>3</sup>. In response to these social and 58 economic burdens, the Ministry of Health and Wellness of Barbados (MoH) has a long history of 59 engaging in public mosquito control and active disease surveillance, where suspected human 60 61 cases are laboratory confirmed, and vector control interventions are conducted in response to both lab results and mosquito surveillance. Interagency collaborations are part of a 62 comprehensive effort to mitigate the toll of endemic dengue<sup>11</sup>. Previous studies performed in 63 Barbados have described climatological and seasonal drivers of dengue transmission, vital 64 components of early warning systems and forecasting models <sup>12</sup>. While large-scale 65 climatological factors undoubtedly play a dominant role in driving outbreaks of mosquito-borne 66 illness, this plays out at the local scale as a function of the human landscape <sup>13,14</sup>. Therefore 67

68 understanding the local distribution of human cases is also necessary for understanding patterns69 of exposure risk and guiding vector abatement strategies.

70 Aedes aegypti is the primary mosquito vector of medical concern throughout the 71 Caribbean. Public health vector control programs are widely acknowledged as cost effective in controlling arboviruses transmitted by Ae. aegypti, relative to costs associated with the delivery 72 73 of health services and supportive care <sup>15</sup>. Nevertheless, public health resources are finite, calling for efficient intervention strategies to target mosquito populations and suppress transmission 74 pathways. Aedes aegypti is a container-breeding mosquito, and successfully exploits 75 76 anthropogenic environments for oviposition and larval rearing. The role of household-level 77 characteristics, such as housing condition and water storage habits, in promoting mosquito production has been repeatedly demonstrated<sup>13,14</sup>. In some instances, favorable microhabitats 78 enable mosquitoes, and subsequently disease transmission, to persist in spite of generally 79 unfavorable environmental conditions <sup>16</sup>. Thus, identifying spatial clusters of high disease 80 81 activity, or "hotspots," can prove invaluable when prioritizing the delivery of abatement and outreach services. Further additional challenges, while not unique in the context of integrated 82 83 vector control, are essential to address for management of mosquito-borne diseases in Caribbean 84 islands. Vector-borne disease risk can shift rapidly on small island like Barbados due to many factors including insecticide resistance, climate variability, climate change, high disease 85 prevalence, and variable mosquito control efforts in response to herd immunity dynamics. Small 86 island developing states in the Caribbean also face challenges to the elimination of Ae. aegypti, 87 88 as reintroductions of pathogens and vectors are frequent due to inter-regional travel, unplanned urbanization, and limited resources for vector control <sup>17</sup>. These management challenges demand 89

90 strategies that incorporate spatially and temporally sensitive methods of detecting transmission91 activity.

92 Geographic information systems (GIS) offer a powerful tool in the visualization and incorporation of spatial epidemiological data into public health programs <sup>18</sup>. While many health 93 departments and ministries have readily adopted GIS methods into their surveillance and 94 95 reporting activities, fewer have extended these methodologies to incorporate statistical tests of spatial dependency in human case data. Local Indicators of Spatial Association (LISA) statistics 96 are routinely used in an exploratory framework to quantitatively describe patterns of spatial 97 dependence and clustering, or dispersion, of disease cases within a defined area of study <sup>19</sup>. 98 Identifying spatially discrete areas of significantly high (i.e. hotspots), or low (i.e. coldspots), 99 disease activity within functional administrative boundaries is a useful framework for crafting 100 responses to outbreak events and future interventions, enabling agencies to focus their efforts 101 more efficiently. Global and local Moran's I tests have been applied in public health contexts to 102 103 describe spatial distributions of mosquito-borne disease outbreaks, including dengue fever, and to detect the location of disease clusters <sup>14,20,21</sup>. 104

While LISA methods give us insight into the spatial structure of disease activity within a given time period, these analyses are temporally static. In instances where georeferenced disease surveillance data are available at regular time intervals, spatial scan statistics can be employed to identify local areas of clustering in multiple dimensions (i.e. space, time, or space-time). Spatial scan statistics are capable of detecting possible disease clustering in case-only surveillance data, using a series of variable search windows to evaluate spatial and temporal trends in the dataset <sup>22,23</sup>. Application of space-time scan statistics can be a powerful tool in disease surveillance and

outbreak detection, where we are interested in describing not only where, but also when clustersof events occur over a continuous period of time.

114 To our knowledge, no previous efforts have described the spatial and temporal 115 distribution of dengue or chikungunya outbreaks in Barbados. Using epidemiological case data collected by the MoH in Barbados from 2013 – 2016, we used exploratory LISA and space-time 116 117 scan statistics to test for spatial and temporal autocorrelation of dengue and chikungunya cases within operational health districts. The objectives of this study were to i) detect global spatial 118 119 dependency, or clustering, of surveillance arbovirus cases reported in Barbados within each year 120 of the study period; ii) when global spatial dependency is detected, identify the locations of hotspots (i.e. clustered) and coldspots (i.e. dispersed) of disease activity; iii) assess the effect of 121 122 different input data on observed spatial patterns; and iv) detect spatiotemporal patterns in disease rates at finer temporal resolutions via spatial scan statistics. This also provides an important 123 124 opportunity to discuss and showcase the implications of how these methods are implemented in 125 situations where data are limited, simply as a function of small populations, as seen in small island nations. 126

### 127 Methods

Study Area and Epidemiological Data – Barbados, situated in the Caribbean, has an estimated residential population of over 277,000<sup>24</sup>. The most densely populated areas are found on the southern side of the island, with the highest population density found around Bridgetown, the capital city <sup>24</sup>. Transmission of mosquito-borne diseases in Barbados is seasonal, with peak transmission typically associated with high numbers of mosquitoes during the rainy season (June –November), and fewer disease cases reported during the dry season (December–May) <sup>12,25</sup>. The MoH of Barbados performs active and passive surveillance for dengue and other mosquito-borne

- diseases via nine polyclinics. These serve seven polyclinic administrative catchment (PAC) areas
- 136 (Branford Taitt, David Thompson, Eunice Gibson, Maurice Byer, Randall Philip, St. Philip, and
- 137 Winston Scott), which are further divided into 63 health districts (Fig. 1).



#### 138

Fig. 1. Health districts and polyclinic administrative catchment (PAC) areas in Barbados. This
figure was produced in ArcMap 10.4 (ESRI, Redlands, CA) using shapefiles from the GADM
database of Global Administrative Areas, ver. 2.8 (gadm.org), and shapefiles provided by the
MoH, Barbados.

143

Public vector control and health services are delivered at the level of health districts, which
range in size from 0.40 km<sup>2</sup> to 26.62 km<sup>2</sup>. The MoH oversees arbovirus sureveillance activities,

146 where suspected human cases of dengue and chikungunya are recorded by the Ministry and

confirmed in the National Reference Laboratory by RT-PCR or ELISA. De-identified, monthly
case totals for dengue fever in each health district were provided by the MoH for the years 2013
- 2016, and we defined the location of cases as the centroid of a given district. Georeferenced
data on lab-confirmed chikungunya cases, aggregated to health districts, were also made
available for this study, but were only available for the 2014 outbreak. Additional GIS data were
provided for this study by the MoH, including shapefiles of the administrative boundaries for
health districts in Barbados.

Global and Local Indicators of Spatial Association – Annual case totals for dengue and 154 155 chikungunya in each health district were aggregated from monthly case data provided by the MoH for each year of the study. Annual per capita disease rates were derived from annual totals 156 and population data from the most recent national census, conducted in 2010<sup>24</sup>. The population 157 of each health district ranged from 68 to 12,743, according to census data. Due to low population 158 159 in some health districts, raw disease rates may be susceptible to instability due to high variance associated with small numerators or denominators (i.e. the "small number problem")<sup>26</sup>. 160 Performing spatial analyses on raw rates with high instability can result in incorrectly identifying 161 162 artefacts of the small number problem as statistically significant outliers. We performed 163 Empirical Bayes smoothing (EB), where the variance of rate estimates is globally reduced via a *priori* probability functions, on raw disease rates in Geoda (ver. 1.12.0) to compensate for high 164 variability in rates due to low health district population. EB smoothed rates were compared to 165 raw disease rates, verifying the overall reduction of variance from smoothing. 166

Global Moran's I with inverse distance weighting (ArcMap, ver. 10.4) was used to test
for spatial autocorrelation in both case counts and smoothed disease rates for dengue and
chikungunya in Barbados for each year of the study. A global indicator of spatial dependence,

the Moran's I statistic provides a measure of the degree of statistically significant clustering or 170 dispersion in disease measures for the entire island. Local Moran's I is a LISA statistic for 171 identifying locations (e.g. health districts within the study area) with statistically similar spatial 172 patterns (e.g. clustering or dispersion) of high and low values (i.e. hotspots or coldspots) on the 173 island <sup>27</sup>. This statistic is also useful for the detection of spatial outliers, locations with 174 significantly extreme values compared to neighboring areas <sup>27</sup>. Local Moran's I with inverse 175 distance weighting was performed for each reported year in ArcMap (ver. 10.4) to identify health 176 districts that were hotspots, or coldspots, of dengue or chikungunya activity. 177

178 Spatial Scan Statistics – We compared the spatial distribution of dengue and chikungunya found via LISA statistical analyses, calculated for each year of the study, to patterns of clustering 179 and dispersion in continuous aggregated cases over the study period. Patterns of spatiotemporal 180 clustering in monthly case totals within each year were tested using the univariate Kuldorrff 181 space-time scan statistics in SaTScan (ver. 9.4.4), where we performed retrospective space-time 182 analyses, scanning for both clustering and dispersion <sup>28</sup>. A circular search window was specified 183 to test for spatiotemporal clustering, comparing cases at each location (i.e. centroids of health 184 districts) to neighboring areas within a variable window, using a time precision of one month. 185 186 Clusters were constrained to a maximum cluster size of 50% of case data, a maximum temporal window of 50% of the study period, and allowed for geographic overlap with other clusters, 187 provided that no neighboring cluster centers were included in a given cluster. Likelihood ratios 188 and associated p-values were reported for each identified cluster, where maximum likelihood 189 190 values were calculated via Monte Carlo simulation (999 replications). Statistically significant clusters ( $\alpha$ =0.05) from the SaTScan analyses were mapped with LISA results for each year in 191 ArcMap (ver. 10.4) for visual comparison. 192

# 193 **Results**

194	The number of dengue cases in Barbados reported by the MoH fluctuated greatly during
195	the study period, with large outbreaks occurring in 2013 (n=526) and 2016 (n=386), and lower
196	case numbers in 2014 (n=147) and 2015 (n=58). Georeferenced cases of chikungunya (n=57)
197	were only available for 2014. We detected statistically significant ( $\alpha$ =0.05) global clustering (i.e.
198	Moran's I values $> 0$ ) in aggregated case counts during the years of large dengue outbreaks, 2013
199	and 2016 (Table 1), while significant global clustering of EB smoothed rates was found in every
200	year for dengue (Table 2). No significant clustering was detected during the 2014 chikungunya
201	outbreak.

Table 1. Global Moran's I values for dengue and chikungunya case totals, aggregated to healthdistrict, in each year in the study.

Arbovirus	Year	Total Cases	Moran's I†	Z-Score	P-value
Dengue	2013	526	0.23	4.40	< 0.001*
Dengue	2014	147	-0.04	-0.51	0.610
Dengue	2015	58	0.04	1.06	0.291
Dengue	2016	386	0.11	2.29	0.022*
Chikungunya	2014	57	0.06	0.84	0.400

<sup>204</sup> *† Moran's I values range between -1 and 1, where negative values indicate dispersion and* 

205 *positive values indicate clustering.* 

206

- **Table 2.** Global Moran's I values for dengue and chikungunya EBS disease rates, aggregated to
- 209 health district, in each year in the study.

Arbovirus	Year	Total Cases	Moran's I†	Z-Score	P-value
Dengue	2013	526	0.290	5.77	< 0.001*
Dengue	2014	147	0.103	2.22	0.026*
Dengue	2015	58	0.166	3.35	< 0.001*
Dengue	2016	386	0.330	6.43	< 0.001*
Chikungunya	2014	57	0.06	1.30	0.192

- 210 *† Moran's I values range between -1 and 1, where negative values indicate dispersion and*
- 211 *positive values indicate clustering.*
- 212
- Local Moran's I revealed shifting locations of dengue hotspots and coldspots at the health
- district level between years in both case totals (Fig. 2) and EB smoothed disease rates (Fig. 3).
- Localized spatial autocorrelation in dengue case counts was found during large outbreak years,
- while significant patterns of clustering in EB smoothed rates of dengue were found in every year.



**Fig. 2.** Patterns of clustering (red) and dispersion (blue) of dengue case totals were found at the

- level of health district in Barbados in 2013 and 2016, as determined by Local Moran's I.
- 220 Spatiotemporal coldspots (blue circles), found via the space-time spatial scan statistic, were
- found in both years. This figure was produced in ArcMap 10.4 (ESRI, Redlands, CA).



# 222

Fig. 3. Patterns of clustering (red) and dispersion (blue) of EB smoothed dengue rates were
found at the level of health district in Barbados for all years of the study, as determined by Local
Moran's I. Spatiotemporal coldspots (blue circles), found via the space-time spatial scan statistic,
were found in 2013 and 2016 for dengue. This figure was produced in ArcMap 10.4 (ESRI,
Redlands, CA).

The locations of hot and cold spots differed for case counts versus rates (Figs. 2 & 3). In years where both cases and rates had significant spatial autocorrelation (i.e. the 2013 and 2016 outbreaks), the highest disease rates were clustered in health districts in the north of the island, while dengue case counts had hotspots and clustered outliers (i.e. health districts with a high number of cases relative to neighboring districts with low counts) in central and southern health

districts. Statistically significant spatial autocorrelation was only detected in smoothed rates in
years of lower dengue burden (i.e. 2014 and 2015). During low burden years, hotspots were
generally identified in northern health districts, while coldspots were detected in southern health
districts (Fig. 3).

In years with large outbreaks of dengue, health districts in the southernmost Randall 237 238 Philip PAC area were identified as hotspots of cases in 2013 (n=4), and in the centrally located St. Philip PAC area in 2016 (n=1) (Fig. 2). Coldspots for dengue cases were detected in health 239 240 districts located in the Maurice Byer (n=5), Branford Taitt (n=4), and Eunice Gibson (n=2) PAC 241 areas in 2013. In 2016, only 3 districts, in the Branford Taitt (n=2) and Winston Scott (n=1) 242 administrative regions, were significant coldspots of cases (Fig. 2). Three health districts, located in Branford Taitt, Eunice Gibson, and David Thompson catchment areas, were found to be 243 clustered outliers in both 2013 and 2016 (Fig. 2). When performing LISA analyses on smoothed 244 245 dengue rates, the northern Maurice Byer PAC area contained all health districts that were 246 hotspots of disease rates in 2013 (n=4) and 2016 (n=4) (Fig. 3). Significantly low rates of dengue were consistently found in southern health districts throughout the study period (Fig. 3). 247

248 Analysis of monthly case data in Barbados via spatial scan statistics did not identify statistically significant hotspots for either dengue or chikungunya. However, spatiotemporal 249 250 coldspots of dengue cases were found in years with high case counts, indicating the duration and 251 location of low disease activity during outbreak years (Table 3). In 2013, a coldspot spanning nine health districts across three PAC areas persisted from January to March (Table 3, Fig. 2). A 252 253 large coldspot was also identified in 2016 from August-October, comprised of 29 health districts 254 across five PAC areas, with a smaller, overlapping coldspot found in June to September of the 255 same year.

- 256 **Table 3.** Statistically significant coldspots in monthly disease counts, calculated using the space-
- time permutation spatial scan statistic in SaTScan. 257

		D. C. I	Health	Duration	Radius	_
Arbovirus	Year	PAC Areas	Districts	(mm/yyyy)	(km)	p-value
Dengue	2013	SP, WS, EG	9	01/2013 – 03/2013	3.03	0.034
Dengue	2016	WS, RP, SP, BT,	29	08/2016 – 10/2016	5.90	< 0.001
Dengue	2016	BT, EG, WS	17	06/2016 – 09/2016	4.63	0.055*

258

SP=St. Philip; WS=Winston Scott; EG=Eunice Gibson; RP=Randall Philip; BT=Branford Taitt

#### 259 Discussion

In this study, we found that cases of dengue fever in Barbados detected via surveillance 260 261 in 2013–2016 exhibit both spatial and temporal structure. Dengue cases showed significant clustering in the central and southwestern health districts only in years with elevated case counts. 262 In constrast, smoothed rates of population-derived incidence revealed clustering in all years for 263 264 dengue, with many hotspots found in northern health districts. The identification of spatial dependence in disease cases is highly relevant for public health professionals working to 265 suppress arbovirus transmission in Barbados, where there is a call to allocate public health 266 267 resources efficiently.

Spatial discrepancies in data inputs (i.e. case numbers vs. population-derived rates) were 268 driven in part by the small and spatially heterogeneous population density of Barbados. 269

270 Consequently, any analyses performed on this system are susceptible to the "small numbers" problem," where estimates of commonly reported epidemiological metrics such as disease 271 272 prevalence and incidence rates can dramatically fluctuate as an artefact of either low density of underlying populations, or relatively low case detection in high density populations  $^{26}$ . 273 274 Procedures to reduce variance in rates, such as EB smoothing, are recommended to reduce the effect of unstable rates in disease mapping and tests for spatial autocorrelation<sup>29</sup>. However, 275 276 broad geospatial prescriptive remedies for the small numbers problem may unintentionally 277 subvert public health agency management priorities, particularly in small island systems with 278 extreme spatial population heterogeneity. Even after smoothing, we observed consistent hotspots of disease activity in northern health districts, where population densities are very low. Health 279 280 districts with significantly high disease rates in low populations may not represent pragmatic 281 management targets, especially in years where resources are limited or outbreaks are focused in 282 urban centers. Although statistically sound, practical application of such analyses should be 283 tempered by the expectations and priorities of public health agencies. In this context, raw case counts may give us a better understanding of operational disease burden on Barbados despite the 284 285 problems typically associated with disregarding underlying population in morbidity metrics, 286 where we would expect to detect more cases in densely populated areas regardless of true risk.

The differences observed in the spatial distribution of cases versus rates have critical implications with regards to intervention strategies and management goals. Although we accounted for inflated variance in rates by performing EB smoothing, hotspots in northern districts still reflect lower absolute case loads than found in densely populated areas in the south, especially in the vicinity of Bridgetown, the capital city. It is therefore imperative that management objectives are clearly specified before using spatial analyses on health surveillance

data for planning purposes. Prioritization of goals is particularly important in a small island with 293 294 high heterogeneity in population density, where making management decisions based on 295 unstable rates could drive misallocation of resources. When responding to endemic transmission or emerging pathogens, like chikungunya, targeting areas with the highest transmission rates (i.e. 296 high numbers of cases relative to the underlying population) should be prioritized to prevent 297 298 further spread. Conversely, when considering large outbreaks of endemic diseases, like dengue, 299 the management focus may be instead on reducing the total number of infections, regardless of 300 population density, to mitigate hyperendemic peak years and reduce costs associated with the 301 delivery of health services. In Barbados, these fundamental management distinctions may be 302 subtle, but as our analyses demonstrate, can require vastly different spatial representations of disease clustering in the study area. This would directly translate to choices of where to allocate 303 resources in particular health districts. 304

While we observed shifts in the clustering and dispersion of disease activity in Barbados 305 306 between years, there were nevertheless consistencies in the location of health districts with clustered dengue cases or rates, especially in outbreak years. In particular, health districts 307 identified as high clustering outliers during peak years were identical in 2013 and 2016. 308 309 suggesting that some areas may have an underlying susceptibility to localized outbreaks when 310 transmission is high (Fig. 2). Although the analyses presented here represent a reactive 311 management approach, in which there is lagged decision-making in response to previously reported case data, spatial methodologies can also be incorporated into proactive strategies as 312 313 part of an early warning system framework. Predictive climatological models of dengue risk have been developed for Barbados, enabling the anticipation of large outbreak events driven by 314 environmental factors <sup>12</sup>. Although useful in terms of triggering agency response ahead of major 315

island wide outbreak events, current probabilistic forecast models do not provide information on *where* to intervene. Here, our spatial analyses point to consistent areas of transmission peaks,
providing complementary analyses to predictive climate modeling efforts, which can be
incorporated into MoH decision making, targeting discrete locations for mosquito control ahead
of anticipated outbreak events.

321 We did not identify significant spatiotemporal clustering of dengue or chikungunya with spatial scan statistics within the study period, although coldspots of low dengue activity were 322 found in years with higher case totals. Previous studies have indicated that spatial scan statistics 323 324 are often more sensitive to the detection of hotspots, particularly when relative risk is low, compared to other exploratory methods of spatial analysis <sup>30,31</sup>. Spatial scan statistics have also 325 326 been used to successfully identify hotspots of mosquito-borne diseases at fine temporal resolutions in systems where diseases are endemic <sup>32,33</sup>. Our inability to detect disease clustering 327 at higher temporal resolutions, even in years with high case counts, perhaps points to a lack of 328 329 within season localized clustering. The coldspots detected in 2016 for dengue coincide with the rainy season in Barbados, when we would expect to see increased transmission (Table 3). 330 Coldspots arise as a result of spatial uniformity in risk outside these areas of unexpectedly low 331 332 transmission. Our ability to detect spatial clustering at subseason scales may alternatively be hindered by human movements, reflecting the difficulty of performing local disease surveillance 333 in transient populations (e.g. commuters and international travelers)<sup>34</sup>. Although the inability to 334 detect monthly clustering of arbovirus cases may limit the utility of spatial scan statistics to 335 336 direct mosquito control activities at fine temporal scales in Barbados, our identification of coldspots during active transmission seasons warrants investigation and future research into 337 potential drivers. 338

Aggregated surveillance data are routinely collected in a public health context, but are not 339 free from limitations. The MoH verifies dengue and chikungunya cases in the laboratory, but 340 341 underreporting of cases is a commonly encountered issue with passive surveillance data in Latin America and the Caribbean, resulting in an underestimation of true disease risk in some areas <sup>35</sup>. 342 The availability of current population data for calculating disease rates is also a limitation of this 343 344 work. Although the projected population growth for Barbados is quite low, the most recent census data were collected in 2010, nearly a decade ago <sup>24</sup>. In a spatial analysis context, 345 aggregation of cases to health districts prevents us from drawing conclusions at finer scales. 346 347 Although this limits our ability to inform household-level interventions within disease clusters, identifying health districts with high level of disease transmission is nevertheless relevant to the 348 operational scale of health services delivered by the MoH in Barbados. Despite these limitations, 349 350 the data used in this study represent the most accurate, and up-to-date estimates of population and disease risk in Barbados. 351

#### **Public Health Implications** 352

These initial results serve as the foundation for incorporating spatial analyses into the 353 354 existing arbovirus surveillance network in Barbados. Moving forward, these methodologies provide us not only with a means of guiding ministry responses to outbreaks of mosquito-borne 355 diseases, but also the impetus for future geospatial analytical health studies in Barbados. 356 357 Exploratory spatial analyses allow us to test hypotheses related to dominant social-ecological drivers of spatial clustering in health districts. Understanding the human characteristics that 358 359 underlie observed spatial patterns can contribute to the development of better intervention 360 methods.

361

# 362 **Declarations**

# **Funding Statement**

- 364 This study was solicited by the Caribbean Institute for Meteorology and Hydrology (CIMH)
- through the United States Agency for International Development's (USAID, Grant ID: AID-538-
- 10-14-00001) Programme for Building Regional Climate Capacity in the Caribbean (BRCCC
- 367 Programme: rcc.cimh.edu.bb/brccc) with funding made possible by the generous support of the
- 368 American people. RL was funded by a Royal Society Dorothy Hodgkin Fellowship.

# 369 **Competing Interests**

370 The authors have no competing interests.

# 371 Authors' Contributions

- 372 CAL, SJR, and AMS conceived of the study. CAL, AMS, MR, AQJH, RM, CJM, LR, MGH,
- ART, DH, and SK compiled the data used in analyses. CAL conducted analyses. CAL, SJR, and
- AMS drafted the manuscript. CAL, AMS, RL, RM, CJM, LR, MGH, ART, MJB, and SJR
- assisted with interpretation of the data and provided feedback for this manuscript. All authors
- 376 read and approved the final manuscript.
- 377
- 378
- 379
- 380
- 381

# 382 Literature Cited

- Knudsen AB. Aedes aegypti and dengue in the Caribbean. *AMCA Mosq News*.
   1983;43(4):269-275.
- 2. Brathwaite Dick O, San Martin JL, Montoya RH, del Diego J, Zambrano B, Dayan GH.
- 386 The History of Dengue Outbreaks in the Americas. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 2012;87(4):584-
- 387 593. doi:10.4269/ajtmh.2012.11-0770
- 388 3. Ryan SJ, Lippi CA, Carlson CJ, et al. Zika Virus Outbreak, Barbados, 2015–2016. Am J
- 389 *Trop Med Hyg.* 2018;98(6):1857-1859. doi:10.4269/ajtmh.17-0978
- 4. Gittens-St Hilaire M, Clarke-Greenidge N. An analysis of the subtypes of dengue fever
- infections in Barbados 2003-2007 by reverse transcriptase polymerase chain reaction. *Virol*
- 392 *J*. 2008;5(1):152. doi:10.1186/1743-422X-5-152
- 393
   5.
   Gubler DJ. The Economic Burden of Dengue. Am J Trop Med Hyg. 2012;86(5):743-744.
- doi:10.4269/ajtmh.2012.12-0157
- 6. Halasa YA, Zambrano B, Shepard DS, Dayan GH, Coudeville L. Economic Impact of

Dengue Illness in the Americas. *Am J Trop Med Hyg*. 2011;84(2):200-207.

- doi:10.4269/ajtmh.2011.10-0503
- 398 7. Shepard DS, Undurraga EA, Halasa YA, Stanaway JD. The global economic burden of
  399 dengue: a systematic analysis. *Lancet Infect Dis.* 2016;16(8):935-941. doi:10.1016/S1473400 3099(16)00146-8
- 401 8. WTTC. Travel and Tourism Economic Impact 2018 Barbados. 2018.

402 9. WTTC. Travel and Tourism Economic Impact 2017 Barbados. 2017.

403	10.	Shirtcliffe P, Cameron E, Nicholson KG, Wiselka MJ. Don't forget dengue! Clinical
404		features of dengue fever in returning travellers. J R Coll Physicians Lond. 1998;32(3):235-
405		237.
406	11.	Trotman A, Mahon R, Shumake-Guillemot J, Lowe R, Stewart-Ibarra AM. Strenghthening
407		climate services for the health sector in the Caribbean. World Meteorol Organ. 2018;67(2).
408	12.	Lowe R, Gasparrini A, Van Meerbeeck CJ, et al. Nonlinear and delayed impacts of climate
409		on dengue risk in Barbados: A modelling study. Thomson M, ed. PLOS Med.
410		2018;15(7):e1002613. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.1002613
411	13.	Stewart-Ibarra AM, Muñoz Ángel G, Ryan SJ, et al. Spatiotemporal clustering, climate
412		periodicity, and social-ecological risk factors for dengue during an outbreak in Machala,
413		Ecuador, in 2010. BMC Infect Dis. 2014;14(1). doi:10.1186/s12879-014-0610-4
414	14.	Lippi CA, Stewart-Ibarra AM, Muñoz ÁG, et al. The Social and Spatial Ecology of Dengue
415		Presence and Burden during an Outbreak in Guayaquil, Ecuador, 2012. Int J Environ Res
416		Public Health. 2018;15(4). doi:10.3390/ijerph15040827
417	15.	Pepin KM, Marques-Toledo C, Scherer L, Morais MM, Ellis B, Eiras AE. Cost-
418		effectiveness of Novel System of Mosquito Surveillance and Control, Brazil. Emerg Infect
419		Dis. 2013;19(4):542-550. doi:10.3201/eid1904.120117
420	16.	Paaijmans KP, Thomas MB. The influence of mosquito resting behaviour and associated
421		microclimate for malaria risk. Malar J. 2011;10(1):183. doi:10.1186/1475-2875-10-183

422	17.	Nathan MB. Critical review of Aedes aegypti control programs in the Caribbean and
423		selected neighborhing countries. J Am Mosq Control Assoc. 1993;9(1-7).
424	18.	McLafferty SL. GIS and Health Care. Annu Rev Public Health. 2003;24(1):25-42.
425		doi:10.1146/annurev.publhealth.24.012902.141012
426	19.	Oliveira MA de, Ribeiro H, Castillo-Salgado C, Oliveira MA de, Ribeiro H, Castillo-
427		Salgado C. Geospatial analysis applied to epidemiological studies of dengue: a systematic
428		review. Rev Bras Epidemiol. 2013;16(4):907-917. doi:10.1590/S1415-
429		790X2013000400011
430	20.	Castillo KC, Körbl B, Stewart A, Gonzalez JF, Ponce F. Application of spatial analysis to
431		the examination of dengue fever in Guayaquil, Ecuador. Procedia Environ Sci. 2011;7:188-
432		193. doi:10.1016/j.proenv.2011.07.033
433	21.	Sugumaran R, Larson SR, DeGroote JP. Spatio-temporal cluster analysis of county-based
434		human West Nile virus incidence in the continental United States. Int J Health Geogr.
435		2009;8(1):43. doi:10.1186/1476-072X-8-43
436	22.	Kulldorff M. A spatial scan statistic. Commun Stat – Theory Methods. 1997;26.
437		doi:10.1080/03610929708831995
438	23.	Kulldorff M, SaTScan <sup>TM</sup> v7.0.3: Software for the spatial and space-time scan statistics.
439		Information Management Services, Inc.
440	24.	BSS. Barbados Population and Housing Census. 2010. http://www.barstats.gov.bb/census/.

441	25.	WMO Caribbea	n Regional	Climate	Centre.	http://rcc.	.cimh.ed	u.bb/. ]	Published	2017	١.
-----	-----	--------------	------------	---------	---------	-------------	----------	----------	-----------	------	----

- 442 Accessed December 29, 2017.
- 443 26. Kennedy S. The small number problem and the accuracy of spatial databases. In: *The*
- 444 Accuracy Of Spatial Databases. CRC Press; 1989:308. doi:10.1201/b12612
- 445 27. Anselin L. Local indicators of spatial association—LISA. *Geogr Anal*. 1995;27(2):93–115.
- 446 28. Kulldorff M, Heffernan R, Hartman J, Assunção R, Mostashari F. A Space–Time
- 447 Permutation Scan Statistic for Disease Outbreak Detection. Blower SM, ed. *PLoS Med.*
- 448 2005;2(3):e59. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.0020059
- 449 29. Olsen SF, Martuzzi M, Elliott P. Cluster analysis and disease mapping--why, when, and
- 450 how? A step by step guide. *BMJ*. 1996;313(7061):863-866. doi:10.1136/bmj.313.7061.863
- 451 30. Barro AS, Kracalik IT, Malania L, et al. Identifying hotspots of human anthrax
- 452 transmission using three local clustering techniques. *Appl Geogr.* 2015;60:29-36.
- 453 doi:10.1016/j.apgeog.2015.02.014
- 454 31. Aamodt G, Samuelsen SO, Skrondal A. A simulation study of three methods for detecting
  455 disease clusters. *Int J Health Geogr.* 2006;5:15. doi:10.1186/1476-072X-5-15
- 456 32. Desjardins MR, Whiteman A, Casas I, Delmelle E. Space-time clusters and co-occurrence
- 457 of chikungunya and dengue fever in Colombia from 2015 to 2016. *Acta Trop.* 2018;185:77-
- 458 85. doi:10.1016/j.actatropica.2018.04.023

459	33.	Coleman M, Coleman M, Mabuza AM, Kok G, Coetzee M, Durrheim DN. Using the
460		SaTScan method to detect local malaria clusters for guiding malaria control programmes.
461		Malar J. 2009;8(1):68. doi:10.1186/1475-2875-8-68
462	34.	Walker AT, LaRocque RC, Sotir MJ. Travel Epidemiology. In: CDC Yellow Book. Centers
463		for Disease Control and Prevention; 2019:720.
464	35.	Torres JR, Orduna TA, Piña-Pozas M, Vázquez-Vega D, Sarti E. Epidemiological
465		Characteristics of Dengue Disease in Latin America and in the Caribbean: A Systematic
466		Review of the Literature. J Trop Med. 2017;2017:8045435. doi:10.1155/2017/8045435