1	Title:	The mortality due to COVID-19 in different nations is associated with the demographic
2		character of nations and the prevalence of autoimmunity.
3	Autho	prs : Bithika Chatterjee ¹ , Rajeeva Laxman Karandikar ^{2, *} and Shekhar C. Mande ^{1, 3, *}
4	1.	National Centre for Cell Science, NCCS Complex, Ganeshkhind, Pune- 411007
5	2.	Chennai Mathematical Institute, H1 SIPCOT IT Park, Siruseri- 603103
6	3.	Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, 2, Rafi Marg, Anusandhan Bhavan, New
7		Delhi- 110001
8		
9	*Corr	responding Author:
10		³ Shekhar C. Mande
11		Director General, Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR)
12		2, Rafi Marg, Anusandhan Bhavan
13		New Delhi 110001, INDIA
14		Email: <u>shekhar@csir.res.in</u>
15		And
16		² Rajeeva Laxman Karandikar
17		Chennai Mathematical Institute
18		H1, SIPCOT IT park
19		Padur PO, Siruseri 603103, INDIA
20		Email: <u>rlk@cmi.ac.in</u>
21		
22		
23		

24 Abstract

25	In the first few months of its deadly spread across the world, Covid-19 mortality has exhibited a
26	wide range of variability across different nations. In order to explain this phenomenon
27	empirically, we have taken into consideration all publicly available data for 106 countries on
28	parameters like demography, prevalence of communicable and non-communicable diseases,
29	BCG vaccination status, sanitation parameters etc. We ran multivariate linear regression models
30	to find that the incidence of communicable diseases correlated negatively while demography,
31	improved hygiene and higher incidence of autoimmune disorders correlated positively with
32	Covid-19 mortality and were among the most plausible factors to explain Covid-19 mortality as
33	compared to the GDP of the nations.

34

35 **Keywords:** SARS-CoV-2 ,Risk factors, Mortality, Epidemiology, Autoimmunity, Hygiene.

37 Introduction

Higher GDP and improved Human Development Index (HDI) has led to improved sanitation and consequently reduction in the load of communicable disease burden in many countries¹. Interestingly, disease burden of non-communicable diseases now occupies areas of major concern in the higher HDI countries. Thus, a distinct correlation between HDI status of a country, and the prevalence of specific diseases has emerged in recent history².

About half of the world's population lives in low and low middle income countries³. 43 Typically access to healthcare facilities, hygiene and sanitation is poorer in these countries and is 44 45 often believed to be the contributing factor of higher incidence of communicable diseases in these countries. Thus, it is not unexpected if infectious disease pandemics, such as that due to 46 SARS-CoV-2, have catastrophic consequences in the low and low-middle income countries. Yet 47 on the contrary, the disease prevalence and the Case Fatality Ratio (CFR) during the Covid-19 48 pandemic shows a contrasting opposite trend in the low and low-middle income countries when 49 compared to that of the high income countries. It is fascinating to explore reasons that would 50 51 explain higher prevalence and deaths due to Covid-19 among richer nations.

An interesting relationship between severity of Covid-19 outcome and several non-52 communicable disorders such as diabetes, hypertension, cardiovascular disorders has been 53 noted^{4–6}. However, the non-communicable disease burden of a country and its apparent relation 54 55 to CFR due to Covid-19 has not been explored in detail yet. As a large population with these disorders lives in the high HDI countries, co-morbidities with diabetes, hypertension, 56 cardiovascular disorders and respiratory disorders might have emerged as important determinants 57 of CFR due to Covid-19 in these countries. Similarly, people above the age of 65 are also 58 believed to be at a greater risk⁷, with the percentage of such people being significantly more in 59

the higher HDI countries⁸. Thus, co-morbidities with non-communicable diseases and the
fraction of people living above the age of 65, being skewed towards the high-income countries,
offers possible explanations to the perplexing observation of CFR dichotomy among nations.

63 Among the many parameters that lead to non-communicable diseases, autoimmunity occupies an important place. Interestingly, a correlation between autoimmune disorders and HDI 64 has been proposed⁹. Since, one of the primary manifestations of Covid-19 has been a severe 65 autoimmune reaction in the later phase of the disease¹⁰, susceptibility to autoimmunity in SARS-66 CoV-2 infection is a possibility to consider. One of the reasons of rising prevalence in 67 68 autoimmune disorders in the western countries has been proposed to be that related to the "hygiene hypothesis"¹¹. The hypothesis postulates that exposure to pathogens early in life 69 protects people from allergic diseases later in their lives. Moreover, improvement in hygiene 70 71 practices such as better sanitation, availability of safe drinking water, hand washing facilities etc. 72 reduces the impact of communicable diseases. On the contrary such a reduction to the exposure to infectious agents might be related to higher prevalence of autoimmune disorders¹². We wished 73 74 to explore if epidemiological data supports correlation between autoimmune diseases' prevalence, sanitation parameters and how much of the variation in death per million due to 75 Covid-19 is explained by the same. We have chosen more than 25 parameters and attempted to 76 77 find correlation between these and CFR, if any. These parameters include GDP, HDI, prevalence of various diseases, demographic parameters, various sanitation parameters etc. Our 78 findings reveal that the apparent correlation between GDP of a nation and Covid-19 related 79 deaths, or that between GDP and CFR, is a manifestation of other parameters. 80

81

82 Methods

The country-wise Covid-19 deaths per million data was collected from <u>https://ourworldindata.org/coronavirus</u>¹³ with the original source: European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC) on the 29th June 2020. We chose deaths per million as compared to the confirmed reported cases as it gives a more reliable parameter to assess the current pandemic. The parameters on obesity (BMI>30, Age and sex standardized) was sourced from the WHO¹⁴ while the parameters on GDP per capita, population density, age profile, gender ratio, HDI and the urban population percentage was sourced from the World Bank organization¹⁵.

We also collected all possible variables that quantify the cleanliness parameters in 90 91 countries. This included the percentage of access to handwashing facilities, access to basic drinking water, availability of basic sanitation, prevalence of open defecation, safe drinking and 92 safe sanitation. Most of these variables were available through WHO and UNICEF water and 93 sanitation surveillance projects¹⁶. The prevalence percentages of different autoimmune disorders 94 95 such as Multiple Sclerosis, Type1 Diabetes Mellitus, Psoriasis, Rheumatoid Arthritis, Asthma, and communicable diseases such as Schistosomiasis, Onchocerciasis, Lymphatic Filariasis, 96 97 Ascaris, Hook worm, Malaria, Tuberculosis, Dengue, Upper respiratory infections, Lower respiratory infections and H influenzae type B meningitis for the year 2017(Age and sex 98 standardized) were downloaded from the http://ghdx.healthdata.org/gbd-results-tool¹⁷. The 99 100 diseases were classified into two broad categories as communicable and non-communicable 101 diseases.

102 The Mean BCG vaccination coverage in percentage was downloaded from WHO¹⁸. The 103 average mean coverage was calculated for all years. The 2017 GDP gross domestic products per 104 capita based on purchasing power parity converted to 2011 international dollars and Human

Development Index 2018 was used for analysis. For details of sources of each variable seeSupplementary Dataset S1.

We further filtered countries that had at least 10 deaths in total and population size of at 107 108 least 100,000. Moreover, we restricted consideration of the countries to have at least 4 deaths/million. For the countries missing corresponding values for our variables, we either 109 imputed them with values smaller than the smallest values in the other countries or dropped the 110 countries from further analyses. For the missing values in variables related to drinking water, 111 sanitation and wash we predicted them using a regression model as we noticed a high correlation 112 amongst each other. For missing values of HDI, we used GDP data to impute values for HDI. 113 After filtration and imputation of missing values we were left with 106 countries with values 114 corresponding to more than 25 variables. For the same countries we downloaded the deaths per 115 million up to 60 days from the onset of the first death occurring in each country on 7th August 116 2020. Subsequently we also added the 90 days and 120 days interval data collected on 16th 117 118 September 2020 to account for the difference in the stage of the epidemic and the lockdown 119 restrictions of each country. It is customary to consider log of GDP instead of GDP for analyses in many disciplines to brings it closer to normal distribution. We also considered log of deaths 120 per million instead of deaths per million for all our calculations. 121

We compared individual (Pearson) correlation coefficients of different variables with the log of deaths per million (LDM) on the 29th June as well as with the 60, 90 and 120 days interval LDM. The variables were compared with log (GDP) and HDI as well. This helped in assessing the important variables to be used in our linear regression model. The country-wise data on various parameters: GDP, HDI, sanitation parameters, prevalence of various communicable and non-communicable diseases were clubbed into development variables (GDP, HDI),

demographics (percentages of older population, urban population and obesity among adults),
Sanitation (percentage of access to handwashing facilities, basic drinking, basic sanitation, no
open defecation, safe drinking and safe sanitation), communicable diseases (Schistosomiasis,
Onchocerciasis, Lymphatic Filariasis, Ascaris, Hook worm, Malaria, Tuberculosis, Dengue,
Upper respiratory infections, Lower respiratory infections and H influenzae type B meningitis)
and non-communicable diseases (Multiple Sclerosis, Type1 Diabetes Mellitus, Psoriasis,
Rheumatoid Arthritis and Asthma).

135 Statistical Analysis used

To explore which of these combined variables are important, we tried multivariate linear regression model using R with several combinations of variables to obtain insights into our understanding of epidemiology of Covid-19. LDM of both scenarios was assessed for its association with our predictor/explanatory variables grouped as described above into development variables, demographic variables, sanitation, tropical diseases and autoimmune disorders. Our final objective was to select the best combination of these groups of variables that would yield the largest adjusted- R^2 value.

143

144 **Results**

Analysis was carried on reported numbers of total 10112754 cases 501562 deaths as on the 29th June 2020 as well as with 60-day interval data as on the 7th August 2020. Further 90 days and 120 days interval data as on 16th September 2020 was also included. Data from well-known corona virus global deaths tracking sources^{19–21} show that more than 70 percent Covid-19 mortality has occurred in high income countries like Italy, Spain, UK, France and USA²². Our analyses also reveal a similar trend (Fig. 1a, b). To explore the dichotomy of rich and poor

countries in relation to Covid-19 deaths, we considered several potential explanatory parameters. The factors included percentage of older population, population density, incidence of communicable and non-communicable diseases etc. The data shows a positive correlation between log (GDP per capita) and log (deaths per million), abbreviated as LDM (Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1, Fig. S1b), which reinforces the information of richer countries being most burdened by the disease.

157 Demographics

Among the many distinctive features of higher GDP countries, are its ageing population 158 159 and a larger fraction of urbanization. We observe that while proportion of population above 65, obesity and the percentage of urban population are positively correlated with the Covid-19 160 deaths (Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1, Fig.S1c, Fig. S1e, Fig. S1g) the gender ratio and 161 162 population density have negligible negative correlation (Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1, Fig.S1d, Fig. S1f). Interestingly, whereas at an individual level gender does seem to have an 163 impact on Covid-19 related death as numerous studies have shown^{23,24}, at the aggregate level the 164 165 gender ratio varies little across countries. Likewise, urbanization has an impact while population density does not seem to have an impact. We observe a positive correlation between LDM and 166 percentage of population with age over 65, which is expected from the reports showing that older 167 population is more susceptible to the virus⁷. Thus, the overall demographic parameters yield a 168 positive correlation with Covid-19 deaths per million (Fig. 2a). 169

170 Safe Sanitation

171 Lack of sanitation and poorer hygiene practices are known to be responsible for the 172 higher communicable disease burden in the low GDP countries¹. It is therefore reasonable to 173 expect that parameters describing safe sanitation and safe drinking water to be correlated

negatively with the Covid-19 deaths. Surprisingly we find a contrary observation, where different sanitation parameters are correlated positively with the Covid-19 outcome (Fig. 2b). It is therefore perplexing to note positive correlation of sanitation parameters, as described in methods, with the Covid-19 CFR (Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1, Fig. S1h-m).

178 *Communicable Diseases*

Several studies have reported the protective role of parasitic/bacterial infections in 179 bolstering human immunity, also referred to as immune training^{25,26}. We observe that the 180 prevalence of communicable diseases such as Malaria and Tuberculosis as well as parasitic 181 diseases such as schistosomiasis, Onchocerciasis have a weak negative correlation with LDM 182 (Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1, Fig. S1t-z1). Upper respiratory diseases however show 183 positive correlation which may be indicative of hyper active immune response in individual 184 185 suffering from such disorder(Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1). These intuitive observations related to communicable diseases with respect to Covid-19 deaths are suggestive of the role of 186 "immune training" and the final disease outcome. 187

188 *BCG vaccination*

Recent studies have suggested that the countries in which the majority population was 189 immunized by BCG vaccine had lower LDM due to trained immunity^{27,28}. We find negligible of 190 191 correlation between BCG vaccination in different countries with LDM (Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1, Fig. S1n). A possible explanation for this difference could be due to the fact that 192 comparisons in the previous studies were made with socially similar nations while we consider a 193 diverse group of countries. Moreover, the distribution showing two distinct clusters for BCG 194 vaccination (Supplementary, Fig. S1n), and with no apparent correlation within the clusters also 195 196 makes it difficult to draw any conclusions on the effect of BCG vaccination on CFR at the

population level. It is also pertinent to note that we find significant negative correlation of mean
BCG vaccination of a country and prevalence of autoimmune disorders (Fig. 3).

199 *Autoimmunity*

One of the manifestations of better hygiene and safe sanitation practices in high GDP countries is the increased incidence in autoimmune disorders²⁹. It has been postulated that better hygiene practices could lower a person's immunity and make the person susceptible to autoimmune diseases. We therefore tested if any of the autoimmune diseases showed an association with the LDM variable. We interestingly find a strong positive correlation with Multiple Sclerosis, Type 1 Diabetes Mellitus, Rheumatoid Arthritis and Psoriasis and a weaker correlation with Asthma (Fig. 2c, Fig. 3, Supplementary, Tables S1, Fig. S1o-s).

207 *Regression Analysis*

208 We now combined many related factors as described in methods such as demographic parameters, sanitation, communicable and non-communicable diseases. These combinations 209 210 were arrived at after calculating correlations among all different parameters under consideration 211 (Fig3, Supplementary, Tables S1). In order to inspect whether development indices like HDI and GDP of countries had an actual impact on our variable of LDM, we ran regression models 212 using combinations of explanatory factors outlined above and checked the correlation between 213 214 the residues, i.e. difference in actual values of the dependent variable and its predicted values from predictor variables, to GDP and HDI. 215

After testing various combinations of these groups, we observe that demographic variables, sanitation parameters and incidence of autoimmune disorders together explain most of the observed variation in LDM and development variables do not seem to count once the effect of these explanatory variables is accounted for (Supplementary, Tables S2). More precisely, if

one uses multiple regression to predict death rates, then the residues are uncorrelated with GDP 220 and HDI. The R value for our final best model for 60 days interval is 0.77 and the adjusted R^2 221 value is 0.53(P-value<0.05). The correlation of this model's residue with GDP and HDI came to 222 223 0.00 and -0.04 respectively (Supplementary, Tables S2). Since in this duration there was strict lockdown imposed upon some of the countries, we also did the same analysis on 90 and 120 days 224 interval data. The R value for 90 days interval came to 0.74 and adjusted R^2 came to 0.48. The 225 analysis on the 120 days interval reduced R values to 0.70 and adjusted R^2 value to 0.42. 226 Although still significant the reduced R^2 and R values as the number of days increases can be 227 attributed to the lowering of deaths in countries whose first wave of infection was completed as 228 well as better preparedness to fight the infection. 229

230

231 **Discussion**

Various corona virus global deaths tracking sources^{19-21,30} point towards uneven 232 distribution of Covid-19 deaths with richer countries having higher CFR. In order to understand 233 234 the reasons behind this paradoxical observation we analyzed publicly available data on various parameters. In this context, it is well known that when we have multiple factors correlated with 235 dependent variable and these factors are themselves mutually correlated, it is not possible to 236 237 determine as to which of these may be the causal variables using purely statistical techniques. To address this, we could collect data from a controlled experiment or look for data on individuals 238 rather than countrywide aggregated data. However, in this instance many variables make sense 239 only at the aggregate level ruling out both these options. Moreover, trends observed at individual 240 level can be opposite to ecological or population level owing to the Simpson's paradox. In such 241 242 challenging situations, it is desirable to use domain knowledge and identify the variables whose

correlation with the dependent variables has a logical explanation. In the present context, older
population having higher death rate can be explained biologically. Similarly, since Covid-19
spreads rapidly via person-to-person contact, population density is likely to have a big impact.

246 Our observation of the weak negative correlation of Covid-19 LDM with communicable diseases, and its positive correlation with incidence of autoimmune disorders in the high GDP 247 countries, is indication of the interplay of host immunity and viral infection. As the parasite and 248 249 bacterial disease burden is high in low and low-middle income countries, this can best be 250 inferred upon by the "immune training" in the population of these countries due to chronic exposure to communicable diseases. It has been observed recently that patients susceptible to the 251 Corona virus exhibited impaired Type 1 interferon activity³¹. Since initially the innate immunity 252 acts upon the virus mediated by the interferon activity, individual with prior infections tend to 253 coup with the virus better than the ones without exposure to pathogens³². The evidence for the 254 255 innate immunity playing major role in susceptibility to the virus is available from the fact that asymptotic patients or patients with mild infection produced poor neutralizing antibodies³³. 256 257 Hence it can be speculated that viral susceptibility is established at the first line of defense known as innate immunity much before the adaptive immunity. As mentioned earlier, the 258 observed correlation between incidence of autoimmune disorders and LDM can be explained as 259 260 Covid-19 seems to lead to severe autoimmune reaction. Paradoxically, better sanitation leads to poorer "immune training" and thus could be leading to higher LDM. Thus, the observed 261 correlation of demographics, autoimmune disorders and sanitation with LDM appears to have 262 explanation coming from the domain. The transfer rate for COVID-19 being high, we see a 263 lower correlation between incidence of communicable diseases and LDM due to COVID-19 as 264 265 compared to autoimmune disorders.

266 As can be seen in (Supplementary, Tables S2), the correlation of GDP and HDI with each 267 model's residue is almost negligible. Both GDP and HDI seem to have a dominant role in determining the deaths per million yet both become insignificant when our linear regression 268 269 models considered other notable and explainable confounding factors such as the demography, 270 sanitation and the pre-Covid prevalence's of autoimmune and tropical diseases. The parameters of sanitation and autoimmune diseases consistently contributed significantly to the R^2 no matter 271 272 which combination of variables were chosen. It has not escaped out attention that there could be 273 other factors such as the country's stage of the epidemic and lower reporting/testing in less 274 developed countries that could also affect the mortality numbers. However, the statistical evidence given by us should give a head start to investigate the role of hyper immune reaction on 275 Covid-19 susceptibility at individual patient's level. 276

We note that statistical analyses such as this attempt to provide evidence of practices of on a macroscopic scale. Individual level variations among people, or communities, typically get masked in such analyses. Thus, although we provide a possible explanation based on sanitation practices on the CFR differences among economically stronger and weaker countries, this should not be inferred as our advocating a move towards weaker hygiene practices for handling future pandemics. Rather this analysis opens up avenues to consider "immune training" with possibilities of microbiome therapies to supplement improved hygiene and sanitation practices.

284

285 Acknowledgements

BC gratefully acknowledges financial support by the National Centre for Cell Science, Pune.Authors declare no competing financial interests.

289 **References**

- 1. GBD 2017 Disease and Injury Incidence and Prevalence Collaborators, Global, regional, and national
- incidence, prevalence, and years lived with disability for 354 diseases and injuries for 195 countries
- and territories, 1990-2017: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017.
- *Lancet*, 2018, **392**, 1789–1858.
- 294 2. Pan, H.-Y., Dai, Y.-N., Zheng, J.-N., et al., National incidence of autoimmune liver diseases and its
- relationship with the human development index. *Oncotarget*, 2016, **7**, 46273–46282.
- 296 3. World Bank Country and Lending Groups World Bank Data Help Desk.
- 297 <u>https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/906519-world-bank-country-and-</u>
- 298 <u>lending-groups</u>.
- Li, B., Yang, J., Zhao, F., et al., Prevalence and impact of cardiovascular metabolic diseases on
 COVID-19 in China. *Clin Res Cardiol*, 2020, **109**, 531–538.
- 5. Yang, J., Zheng, Y., Gou, X., et al., Prevalence of comorbidities in the novel Wuhan coronavirus
- 302 (COVID-19) infection: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *International journal of infectious* 303 *diseases*, 2020.
- 304 6. Emami, A., Javanmardi, F., Pirbonyeh, N., and Akbari, A., Prevalence of underlying diseases in
- hospitalized patients with COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Archives of academic*
- 306 *emergency medicine*, 2020, **8**.
- 307 7. COVID-19 and Older Persons: A Defining Moment for an Informed, Inclusive and Targeted
 308 ResponseUnited Nations For Ageing | United Nations For Ageing.
- 309 https://www.un.org/development/desa/ageing/news/2020/05/covid19/
- 310
- 8. Roser, M., Human development index (HDI). *Our World in Data*, 2014.

- 312 <u>https://ourworldindata.org/human-</u>
- 313 developmentindex#:~:text=The%20Human%20Development%20Index%20(HDI)%20provides
- 314 %20a%20single%20index%20measure,a%20decent%20standard%20of%20living.
- 315 9. Grosse, J., Hornstein, H., Manuwald, U., Kugler, J., Glauche, I., and Rothe, U., Incidence of diabetic
- 316 ketoacidosis of new-onset type 1 diabetes in children and adolescents in different countries
- 317 correlates with human development index (HDI): an updated systematic review, meta-analysis, and
- 318 meta-regression. *Hormone and Metabolic Research*, 2018, **50**, 209–222.
- 10. Galeotti, C. and Bayry, J., Autoimmune and inflammatory diseases following COVID-19. *Nature*
- 320 *Reviews Rheumatology*, 2020, **16**, 413–414.
- 11. Okada, H., Kuhn, C., Feillet, H., and Bach, J., The 'hygiene hypothesis' for autoimmune and allergic
 diseases: an update. *Clinical & Experimental Immunology*, 2010, 160, 1–9.
- Bach, J.-F., The hygiene hypothesis in autoimmunity: the role of pathogens and commensals. *Nature Reviews Immunology*, 2018, 18, 105.
- 13. Roser, M., Ritchie, H., Ortiz-Ospina, E., and Hasell, J., Coronavirus pandemic (COVID-19). *Our*
- 326 *World in Data*, 2020.
- 327 Our World in Data, 2020. <u>https://ourworldindata.org/coronavirus</u>
- 14. GHO. https://www.who.int/data/gho. Accessed 29 June 2020.
- 329 15. World Bank Open Data | Data. <u>https://data.worldbank.org/</u>.
- 16. Water, sanitation and hygiene exposure. <u>https://www.who.int/data/gho/data/themes/water-</u>
- 331 <u>sanitation-and-hygiene</u>.
- 332 17. GBD Results Tool | GHDx. <u>http://ghdx.healthdata.org/gbd-results-tool.</u>
- 18. BCG. https://www.who.int/data/gho/data/themes/topics/topic-details/GHO/bcg.
- 19. WHO Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Dashboard. <u>https://covid19.who.int</u>.
- 335
- 336 20. COVID-19 Map. Johns Hopkins Coronavirus Resource Center.

- 337 <u>https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/map.html</u>.
- 21. COVID-19 situation update worldwide, as of 18 July 2020. European Centre for Disease Prevention
- and Control. https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/geographical-distribution-2019-ncov-cases.
- 22. Schellekens, P. and Sourrouille, D., Tracking COVID-19 as Cause of Death: Global Estimates of
- Relative Severity. 2020.
- 342 23. Walter, L. A. and McGregor, A. J., Sex-and Gender-specific Observations and Implications for
- 343 COVID-19. Western Journal of Emergency Medicine, 2020, **21**, 507.
- 24. Jin, J.-M., Bai, P., He, W., et al., Gender Differences in Patients With COVID-19: Focus on Severity
- and Mortality. *Front. Public Health*, 2020, **8**.
- 25. Netea, M. G., Quintin, J., and van der Meer, J. W. M., Trained Immunity: A Memory for Innate Host
 Defense. *Cell Host & Microbe*, 2011, 9, 355–361.
- 26. Quinn, S. M., Cunningham, K., Raverdeau, M., et al., Anti-inflammatory Trained Immunity
- 349 Mediated by Helminth Products Attenuates the Induction of T Cell-Mediated Autoimmune Disease.
- 350 *Front. Immunol.*, 2019, **10**.
- 27. Escobar, L. E., Molina-Cruz, A., and Barillas-Mury, C., BCG vaccine protection from severe
- 352 coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). *PNAS*, 2020.
- 28. Mandated Bacillus Calmette-Guérin (BCG) vaccination predicts flattened curves for the spread of
- 354 COVID-19 | Science Advances. <u>https://advances.sciencemag.org/content/6/32/eabc1463</u>
- Bach, J.-F. and Chatenoud, L., The hygiene hypothesis: an explanation for the increased frequency of
 insulin-dependent diabetes. *Cold Spring Harbor perspectives in medicine*, 2012, 2, a007799.
- 357 30. Schellekens, P. and Sourrouille, D. M., Covid-19 Mortality in Rich and Poor Countries: A Tale of
- 358 *Two Pandemics?* SSRN Scholarly Paper, Social Science Research Network, Rochester, NY, 2020.
- 359 31. Hadjadj, J., Yatim, N., Barnabei, L., et al., Impaired type I interferon activity and inflammatory
- responses in severe COVID-19 patients. *Science*, 2020, **369**, 718–724.

- 361 32. Rouse, B. T. and Sehrawat, S., Immunity and immunopathology to viruses: what decides the
- 362 outcome? *Nat Rev Immunol*, 2010, **10**, 514–526.
- 363 33. Long, Q.-X., Tang, X.-J., Shi, Q.-L., et al., Clinical and immunological assessment of asymptomatic
- 364 SARS-CoV-2 infections. *Nature Medicine*, 2020, **26**, 1200–1204.

- ---

Table 1. R- the correlation coefficient of combinations of variables with log (Deaths/Million)

LDM for 60,90 and 120 days interval and 29th June based on multiple regression analysis as well

as correlation of the residues with log (GDP) and HDI. Also showing the adjusted R^2 ; N=106.

Broad category variables	Explanatory variables	Duration	R with LDM as dependent variable	Adjusted R ²	R between residue and (log) GDP	R between residue and HDI
	Age>65yrs, s Obesity, Urban	29 th June	0.49	0.22	0.04	0.01
Demographics		60 days	0.58	0.32	0.02	0.00
		90 days	0.50	0.22	0.03	0.00
		120 days	0.40	0.14	0.02	0.01
	Handwash,					
	Basic drinking	29 th June	0.54	0.25	0.11	0.03
~ • •	water, Basic tion sanitation, NO open					
Sanitation		60 days	0.63	0.36	0.05	0.02
		90 days	0.56	0.27	0.10	0.03
	Safe sanitation,	120 days	0.47	0.18	0.08	0.01

	Safe drinking water					
Autoimmune Diseases	Multiple Sclerosis, Rheumatoid Arthritis, Asthma, Psoriasis, Type1 Diabetes	29 th June 60 days 90 days 120 days	0.64 0.70 0.66 0.61	0.39 0.46 0.40 0.34	0.15 0.12 0.12 0.10	0.11 0.12 0.08 0.07
Demographics & Sanitation	MellitusAge >65yrs,Obesity, Urbanpopulation,Handwash,Basic drinkingwater, Basicsanitation, NOopendefecation,Safe sanitation, Ing	29 th June 60 days 90 days 120 days	0.63 0.69 0.64 0.57	0.35 0.42 0.35 0.27	0.06 0.03 0.05 0.02	0.00 -0.01 -0.01 -0.01
	water					

	Handwash,					
	Basic drinking	29 th June	0.68	0.40	0.10	0.02
	water, Basic					
	sanitation, NO					
	open					
	defecation,					
	Safe sanitation,					
Sanitation &	Safe drinking					
Autoimmune	water, Multiple					
Diseases	Sclerosis,	60 days	0.75	0.50	0.03	0.00
	Rheumatoid	90 days	0.69	0.42	0.09	0.01
	Arthritis,	120 days	0.64	0.35	0.07	0.01
	Asthma,					
	Psoriasis,					
	Type1					
	Diabetes					
	Mellitus					
D	Age >65yrs,					
Demographics	Obesity,					
, Sanitation &	Urban,	29 th June	0.74	0.48	0.04	-0.03
Autoimmune	Handwash,					
Diseases	Basic drinking					

water, Basic

sanitation, NO

open

defecation,

Safe sanitation,

Safe drinking

water, Multiple	60 days	0.77	0.53	0.00	-0.04
Sclerosis,	90 days	0.74	0.48	0.03	-0.03

0.42

0.01

-0.03

0.70

120 days

Arthritis,

Rheumatoid

Asthma,

Psoriasis,

Type1

Diabetes

Mellitus

388			
389			
390			
391			
392			
393			
394			
395			

396 Figure legends

- **Figure 1a.** The number of Deaths per Million inhabitants in each country due to Covid-19 up to
- 398 29th June 2020. Color gradient indicates the country's log (GDP).



- 410 Figure 1b. The number of Deaths per Million inhabitants in each country due to Covid-19 60
- 411 days after onset of 1^{st} death. Color gradient indicates the country's log (GDP).





Figure 2. The actual values of log (deaths per million) 60 days after onset of 1^{st} death or LDM plotted against their predicted values. The explanatory variables have been grouped, as described in the text, into a) demographics, b) sanitation, c) autoimmune diseases, d) demographics & sanitation, e) sanitation & autoimmune diseases and f) demographics, sanitation and autoimmune diseases. Regression analysis were done with LDM as dependent variable and the combinations of different variables; N=106. Each dot represents a country. The R² of each graph is depicted in Table 1.

- 423
- 424



Figure 3. Plot showing correlation matrix of every variable with each other. The color key is depicted as -1(red) showing inverse correlation, 0 showing no correlation, and +1(blue) showing maximum positive correlation. The sizes of the circles range from small (low correlation) to larger (high correlation). Here the Log (deaths per million) is from the 60 days interval data; N=106.

431



432