

Supplementary File 1. Search strategy

Comparative Immunogenicity, Safety and Efficacy profiles of four COVID-19 Vaccine types in healthy adults: Systematic Review cum Meta-analysis of Clinical Trial data

Si Qi YOONG^a, Priyanka BHOWMIK^b, Debprasad DUTTA^{c,d,*}

Authors Affiliations:

Si Qi YOONG

^a Alice Lee Centre for Nursing Studies, Yong Yoo Lin School of Medicine
National University of Singapore, Singapore

Priyanka BHOWMIK

^b Tbilisi State Medical University, Georgia

Debprasad DUTTA^{*}

^c Mazumdar Shaw Center for Translational Research (MSCTR), Mazumdar Shaw Medical Foundation, Bangalore, India

^d Institute of Infection, Veterinary and Ecological Sciences (IVES), University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK

Email: debduutta.bio@gmail.com

Table S1. PICO Concept (PubMed Syntax and Logic)

PICO	Concept	Search terms	
		Index terms	Keywords
Population	Adults	"Adult"[Mesh] OR "Young Adult"[Mesh]	"adult*"[Title/Abstract] OR "young adult"[Title/Abstract]
		"Middle Aged"[Mesh]	"middle age*"[Title/Abstract] OR "age"[Title/Abstract] OR "older adult*"[Title/Abstract]
Intervention	COVID-19 vaccines	"COVID-19 Vaccines"[Mesh]	"covid 19 vaccine*"[Title/Abstract] OR "coronavirus vaccine*"[Title/Abstract] OR "sars cov 2 vaccine*"[Title/Abstract] OR "ncov vaccine*"[Title/Abstract]
Outcome	Immunogenicity, Safety, efficacy and effectiveness	"Immunity"[MeSH Terms] OR "immunity, cellular"[MeSH Terms] OR "immunity, heterologous"[MeSH Terms] OR "immunity, humoral"[MeSH Terms]	"immunit*"[Title/Abstract] OR "humoral immunit*"[Title/Abstract] OR ("antibod*[All Fields] AND "response*"[Title/Abstract]) OR "immune response*"[Title/Abstract] OR "cellular immunit*"[Title/Abstract] OR "t cell response*"[Title/Abstract] OR ("antibod*[All Fields] AND "titer*"[Title/Abstract])

		"Spike Glycoprotein, Coronavirus"[Mesh]	"spike protein"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 spike antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "s protein"[Title/Abstract] OR "spike protein antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 spike protein antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "s protein antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 igg"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 quantivac elisa"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti spike antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "covid 19 antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "coronavirus spike protein"[Title/Abstract] OR "neutralising antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "neutralizing antibod*"[Title/Abstract]
		"Safety"[Mesh]	"safety"[Title/Abstract] OR "side effect*"[Title/Abstract] OR "adverse effect*"[Title/Abstract] OR "adverse event*"[Title/Abstract]
		"Vaccine Efficacy"[Mesh]	"efficacy"[Title/Abstract] OR "effectiveness"[Title/Abstract]

Table S2. Pubmed search strategy

Search no.	Query	Results
#1	("Adult"[Mesh] OR "Young Adult"[Mesh]) OR ("adult*"[Title/Abstract] OR "young adult"[Title/Abstract])	8,470,351
#2	("Middle Aged"[Mesh]) OR ("middle age*"[Title/Abstract] OR "age"[Title/Abstract] OR "older adult*"[Title/Abstract])	6,306,623
#3	(#1) OR (#2)	9,469,885
#4	("COVID-19 Vaccines"[Mesh]) OR ("covid 19 vaccine*"[Title/Abstract] OR "coronavirus vaccine*"[Title/Abstract] OR "sars cov 2 vaccine*"[Title/Abstract] OR "ncov vaccine*"[Title/Abstract])	15,668
#5	("Immunity"[MeSH Terms] OR "immunity, cellular"[MeSH Terms] OR "immunity, heterologous"[MeSH Terms] OR "immunity, humoral"[MeSH Terms]) OR ("immunit*"[Title/Abstract] OR "humoral immunit*"[Title/Abstract] OR ("antibod*"[All Fields] AND "response*"[Title/Abstract]) OR "immune response*"[Title/Abstract] OR "cellular immunit*"[Title/Abstract] OR "t cell response*"[Title/Abstract] OR ("antibod*"[All Fields] AND "titer*"[Title/Abstract]))	895,807
#6	("Spike Glycoprotein, Coronavirus"[Mesh]) OR ("spike protein"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 spike antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "s protein"[Title/Abstract] OR "spike protein antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 spike protein antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "s protein antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 igg"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti sars cov 2 quantivac elisa"[Title/Abstract] OR "anti spike antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "covid 19 antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "coronavirus spike protein"[Title/Abstract] OR "neutralising antibod*"[Title/Abstract] OR "neutralizing antibod*"[Title/Abstract])	48,930
#7	("Safety"[Mesh]) OR ("safety"[Title/Abstract] OR "side effect*"[Title/Abstract] OR "adverse effect*"[Title/Abstract] OR "adverse event*"[Title/Abstract])	1,144,576
#8	("Vaccine Efficacy"[Mesh]) OR ("efficacy"[Title/Abstract] OR "effectiveness"[Title/Abstract])	1,401,732
#9	((#5) OR (#6)) OR (#7) OR (#8)	3,015,497
#10	((#3) AND (#4)) AND (#9)	2,905

Limit: - none; last date of search- 19-04-22

Table S3. Embase search strategy

Search no.	Queries	Results
#1	'adult'/exp OR 'adult' OR 'adult':ti,ab,kw OR 'adults':ti,ab,kw OR 'young adult'/exp OR 'young adult' OR 'middle aged'/exp OR 'middle aged' OR 'middle age':ti,ab,kw OR 'middle aged':ti,ab,kw	10,780,252
#2	'sars-cov-2 vaccine'/exp OR '2019-ncov vaccine' OR '2019-ncov virus vaccine' OR 'covid 19 vaccine' OR 'covid-19 mrna vaccine' OR 'covid-19 recombinant protein vaccine' OR 'covid-19 vaccine' OR 'covid-19 vaccines' OR 'covid-19 virus vaccine' OR 'covid19 vaccine' OR 'covid19 virus vaccine' OR 'hcov-19 vaccine' OR 'hcov-19 virus vaccine' OR 'human coronavirus 2019 vaccine' OR 'sars coronavirus 2 vaccine' OR 'sars-cov-2 inactivated vaccine' OR 'sars-cov-2 mrna vaccine' OR 'sars-cov-2 recombinant protein vaccine' OR 'sars-cov-2 vaccine' OR 'sars-cov-2 virus vaccine' OR 'sars2 vaccine' OR 'sars2 virus vaccine' OR 'wuhan coronavirus vaccine' OR 'coronavirus disease 2019 vaccine' OR 'inactivated covid-19 vaccine' OR 'inactivated sars-cov-2 vaccine' OR 'mrna covid-19 vaccine' OR 'mrna sars-cov-2 vaccine' OR 'ncov-2019 vaccine' OR 'ncov-2019 virus vaccine' OR 'novel 2019 coronavirus vaccine' OR 'novel coronavirus 2019 vaccine' OR 'severe acute respiratory syndrome 2 vaccine' OR 'severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 vaccine'	18,740
#3	'vaccine immunogenicity'/exp OR 'immunogenicity, vaccine' OR 'vaccine immunogenicity' OR 'vaccine immunogenicity' OR 'coronavirus spike glycoprotein'/exp OR 'coronavirus s glycoprotein' OR 'coronavirus glycoprotein s' OR 'coronavirus spike glycoprotein' OR 'coronavirus spike glycoproteins' OR 'coronavirus spike protein' OR 'coronavirus spike proteins' OR 'spike glycoprotein, coronavirus' OR 'adverse event'/exp OR 'adverse effect' OR 'adverse effects' OR 'adverse event' OR 'adverse events' OR 'adverse reaction' OR 'side effect'/exp OR 'side effect' OR 'side reaction' OR 'vaccine'/exp OR 'combined vaccine' OR 'vaccin' OR 'vaccine' OR 'vaccine control' OR 'vaccine efficacy' OR 'vaccine potency' OR 'vaccine safety' OR 'vaccines' OR 'vaccines, combined'	2,343,989
#4	#1 AND #2 AND #3	8,692

Limit: - none; last date of search- 18-04-22

Table S4. Scopus search strategy

Search no.	Queries	Results
#1	TITLE-ABS-KEY ("adult*" OR "young adult" OR "middle age*" OR "age")	11,647,399
#2	TITLE-ABS-KEY ("COVID 19 vaccin*" OR "coronavirus vaccin*" OR "sars cov 2 vaccin*" OR "ncov vaccin*")	19,774
#3	TITLE-ABS-KEY ("immunit*" OR "humoral immunit*" OR "immune response*" OR "cellular immunit*" OR "t cell response*") OR (ALL ("antibod*") AND TITLE-ABS-KEY ("response*")) OR (ALL ("antibod*") AND TITLE-ABS-KEY ("titer*"))	1,331,255
#4	TITLE-ABS-KEY (("spike protein" OR "anti sars cov 2 spike antibod*" OR "s protein" OR "spike protein antibod*" OR "anti sars cov 2 spike protein antibod*" OR "s protein antibod*" OR "anti sars cov 2 igg" OR "anti sars cov 2 quantivac elisa" OR "anti spike antibod*" OR "covid 19 antibod*" OR "coronavirus spike protein" OR "neutralising antibod*" OR "neutralizing antibod*"))	69,519
#5	TITLE-ABS-KEY (("safety" OR "side effect*" OR "adverse effect*" OR "adverse event*"))	2,719,991
#6	TITLE-ABS-KEY ("efficacy" OR "effectiv*")	7,854,548
#7	PUBYEAR > 2019	8,618,917
#8	#3 OR #4 OR #5 OR #6	10,713,607
#9	#1 AND #2 AND #7 AND #8	5,182

Table S5. Web of Science search strategy

Search no.	Queries	Results
#1	TS=(adult OR young adult OR middle age OR older adult)	1,975,375
#2	TS=(COVID-19 vaccine OR sars-cov-2 vaccine)	21,626
#3	TS=(immunogenicity OR immune* OR immune response OR antibody)	1,648,927
#4	TS=(spike glycoprotein OR spike protein OR covid-19 antibod* OR neutralizing antibod* OR anti-sars-cov-2)	79,281
#5	TS=(safety OR side effect OR adverse effect OR adverse event)	1,843,421
#6	TS=(vaccine efficacy OR effectiveness)	1,271,579
#7	#3 OR #4 OR #5 OR #6	4,517,221
#8	#1 AND #2 AND #7	1,195

TS = topic (search for title, abstracts, keywords)

Limit: - none; last date of search- 18-04-22

Table S6. Cochrane search strategy

Date Run: 19/04/2022 17:15:03

Search	Queries	Results
#1	MeSH descriptor: [Adult] explode all trees	490970
#2	MeSH descriptor: [Middle Aged] explode all trees	332926
#3	#1 OR #2	490970
#4	MeSH descriptor: [COVID-19 Vaccines] explode all trees	119
#5	MeSH descriptor: [Immunity, Humoral] explode all trees	180
#6	MeSH descriptor: [Immunity, Cellular] explode all trees	1727
#7	MeSH descriptor: [Immunity, Heterologous] explode all trees	10
#8	MeSH descriptor: [Immunity] explode all trees	4177
#9	MeSH descriptor: [Immunoglobulins] explode all trees	28684
#10	MeSH descriptor: [Spike Glycoprotein, Coronavirus] explode all trees	25
#11	MeSH descriptor: [Antibodies, Neutralizing] explode all trees	539
#12	MeSH descriptor: [Safety] explode all trees	4142
#13	MeSH descriptor: [Vaccine Efficacy] explode all trees	12
#14	#5 OR #6 OR #7 OR #8 OR #9 OR #10 OR #11 OR #12 OR #13	34832
#15	#3 AND #4 AND #14	67

Table S7. Search strategies in other databases

Serial no.	Databases	Search queries	Results
1	Science Direct	Searching strategy: "COVID-19 vaccine" AND ("effectiveness" OR "efficacy" OR "immunogenicity" OR "safety") AND "adult"	134
2	POPLINE	((Abstract:(immune response* after COVID-19 vaccin*)) OR (Abstract:(spike protein antibod* post COVID-19 vaccin*)) OR (Abstract:(cellular immunity after SARS-CoV-2 vaccine*)) OR (SARS-CoV-2 antibod*) OR (neutralizing antibod*) OR (neutralising antibod*)) AND (Abstract:(COVID-19 vaccine* OR SARS-CoV-2 vaccine*)) AND (safety OR adverse effect* OR side effect*) AND (efficacy OR effective OR effectiveness) NOT (Abstract:(cancer)) NOT (Abstract:(leukemia)) NOT (Abstract:(hemodialysis)) NOT (Abstract:(animal*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(transplant*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(patient*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(veteran*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(adolescent children cancer leukemia hemodialysis thalassemia pregnant geriatric))	653
3	HINARI	((Abstract:(immune response* after COVID-19 vaccin*)) OR (Abstract:(spike protein antibod* post COVID-19 vaccin*)) OR (Abstract:(cellular immunity after SARS-CoV-2 vaccine*)) OR (SARS-CoV-2 antibod*) OR (neutralizing antibod*) OR (neutralising antibod*)) AND (Abstract:(COVID-19 vaccine* OR SARS-CoV-2 vaccine*)) AND (safety OR adverse effect* OR side effect*) AND (efficacy OR effective OR effectiveness) NOT (Abstract:(cancer)) NOT (Abstract:(leukemia)) NOT (Abstract:(hemodialysis)) NOT (Abstract:(animal*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(transplant*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(patient*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(veteran*)) NOT (TitleCombined:(adolescent children cancer leukemia hemodialysis thalassemia pregnant geriatric))	200
4	Google Scholar	with all of the words- immune response post COVID 19 vaccination with the exact phrase- COVID 19 vaccine with at least one of the words- spike protein antibody OR COVID-19 vaccines without the words- cancer leukemia hemodialysis malignancy adolescent rheumatoid arthritis	520
5	ClinicalTrials.gov	"COVID-19" and "vaccine". Filters: Status = "Completed" or "terminated" or "unknown status", Population = "Adult (18-64)".	253
6	WHO ICTRP	COVID-19 Special collection. Filtered using Excel: 1 - Last Refreshed on: 2020 or 2021 or 2022; 2 - Public title: contains "vaccin" 3 - Inclusion agemin: >= 18 yrs old, or NA/blank 4 - Inclusion agemax: <= 65 yrs old, or NA/blank	584

(NEJM= COVID-19 vaccines = 97 results)