Supplements to "Mortality outcomes with hydroxychloroquine and chloroquine in COVID-19: an international collaborative meta-analysis of randomized trials"

- 1. Search strategy
- 2. Template for invitation email
- 3. Table S1. Group-level characteristics of unavailable trials
- 4. Table S2A. Subgroup analyses
- 5. Table S2B. Sensitivity analyses
- 6. Figures S1A-C. Forest plots for sensitivity analyses

Supplement 1. Search strategy

The COVID-evidence database includes trials registered on Clinical Trials.gov or the WHO International Clinical Trials Registry Platform up to June 11, 2020, as well as trials published on the following sources up to April 9, 2020: PubMed, medrXiv, biorXiv, the WHO COVID-19 literature database, and a listing of all trials with ethical approval in Switzerland (for details please see the COVID-evidence study protocol on the Open Science Framework: http://dx.doi.org/10.17605/OSF.IO/GEHFX).

This Supplement describes the search strategy used to complement the COVID-evidence database with trials registered or published after April 9, 2020.

PubMed and the Cochrane COVID-19 trial registry were searched from inception to June 11, 2020. Search terms included extensive controlled vocabulary and Medical Subject Headings (MeSH). Search terms were the following: corona[ti] OR covid*[ti] OR sars[ti] OR severe acute respiratory syndrome[ti] OR ncov*[ti] OR "severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2" [Supplementary Concept] OR "COVID-19" [Supplementary Concept] OR (wuhan[tiab] AND coronavirus[tiab]) OR (wuhan[tiab] AND pneumonia virus[tiab]) OR COVID19[tiab] OR COVID-19[tiab] OR SARS-CoV-2[tiab] OR SARS2[tiab] OR SARS-2[tiab] OR "severe acute respiratory syndrome 2"[tiab] OR 2019-nCoV[tiab] OR (novel coronavirus[tiab] AND 2019[tiab]) NOT (animals[mesh] NOT humans[mesh]) AND ("2019/12/01"[EDAT] : "3000/12/31"[EDAT])

AND

 $(((hydroxychloroquine[MeSH\,Terms])\,OR\,(chloroquine[MeSH\,Terms]))\,OR\,(hydroxychloroquine[Title/Abstract]))\\OR\,(chloroquine[Title/Abstract])$

AND

(randomized controlled trial[pt] OR controlled clinical trial[pt] OR randomized[tiab] OR placebo[tiab] OR clinical trials as topic[mesh:noexp] OR randomly[tiab] OR trial[ti] NOT (animals[mh] NOT humans [mh]))

The search was updated on September 14, 2020.

Supplement 2. Template for invitation email

Subject: Invitation to co-author a large-scale international collaborative meta-analysis on mortality in COVID-19 trials

Dear Dr. < last name>,

We are currently conducting a large-scale international collaborative meta-analysis on mortality in all ongoing or completed randomized clinical trials evaluating hydroxychloroquine or chloroquine for COVID-19. We are inviting all research groups worldwide testing these drugs to provide urgently needed evidence. We have no commercial interest with this work and aim to rapidly publish the results in a peer-reviewed journal. **Your core team is invited to co-author the publication.**

We use our COVID-evidence database (www.covid-evidence.org) for this work. COVID-evidence is supported by the Swiss National Science Foundation (Project ID 196190) and a large collaboration of researchers from Switzerland, the US, China, Canada, UK, France, Germany, Austria, Sweden, Netherlands, and other countries. Our registered protocol can be found **attached** as well as registered on the Open Science Framework: [link]. Trials that are eligible for this project can be found at the end of the protocol.

Your study **<url>** is of high importance for this project. We would like to ask you how many patients died in your trial (see short questions below). We will use standard methods of meta-analysis and focus only on group-level (aggregated) mortality (no individual patient data needed). We will not do an in-depth review of the included trials as we aim to rapidly provide results, ideally from all trials worldwide. We describe the details of the study in the attached protocol.

For the meta-analysis, we kindly ask you to answer the following questions before July 7. If you are interested in collaborating, please let us know of your interest as soon as possible.

Question 1: Could you please confirm that these criteria apply to your trial?

- a) The trial is randomized and started enrollment before June 1, 2020
- b) The trial has at least one group of patients who receive hydroxychloroquine or chloroquine
- c) The trial has at least one control group that does not receive hydroxychloroquine or chloroquine

Question 2: For each of your study arms,

- a) What intervention did this group receive?
- b) How many patients were randomized to this group?
- c) Of these patients, how many have died?
- d) Of these patients, for how many it is unknown if they are dead or alive?

Please note that we are interested in these raw numbers regardless of the results of any statistical test. The numbers will be used to finalize the manuscript described in our registered protocol (attached).

We strive for a rapidly available, maximally informative publication with full transparency on methods. With this publication we aim to make sure that all clinical trial data hitherto collected (unpublished or published) will be of use, regardless of whether the target sample size of each trial was reached or not. We invite your core investigator team as co-authors. The manuscript will be shared with all co-authors for comments and the finalized manuscript will be uploaded as a preprint at medrXiv in parallel with submission to a peer-reviewed medical journal such as JAMA or the BMJ.

Thank you for considering our request! We kindly ask for your answer **before July 7**. If you are interested in collaborating, but are uncertain whether the data may be shared before July 7, please respond as soon as possible. Should you have any questions or comments, please let us know.

Best regards,

Cathrine Axfors, Andreas Schmitt, David Moher, Steve Goodman, John Ioannidis and Lars Hemkens for the COVID-evidence team www.covid-evidence.org

Table S1. Group-level characteristics of randomized clinical trials evaluating hydroxychloroquine or chloroquine as treatment for COVID-19 not included in the meta-analysis.

Register ID	Contact name	Arms (n)	Treatment comparisons		Targeted sample size	Location	Setting	Trial status
			Experimental group (HCQ	Control group				
NCT04315948	Ader	4	or CQ) HCQ	SoC	3100	International	Inpatient	Recruiting
NCT04391127	Arreola Guerra	5	HCQ	Placebo	200	Mexico	Inpatient	Recruiting
NCT04351516	Bitzer	2	HCQ	Placebo	350	Germany	Outpatient	Recruiting
NCT04359953	Blanc	4	HCQ	Soc	1600	France	Inpatient	Not yet recruiting
ISRCTN86534580	Butler	2	HCQ	SoC	3000	Europe	Inpatient	Recruiting
ChiCTR2000029939	Cai	2	CQ	SoC	100	China	Inpatient	Recruiting
EUCTR2020-001271-33	CHU Angers study	2	HCQ	Placebo	1300	France	Inpatient	Completed
EUCTR2020-001270-29	team Sanofi Aventis study team	2	HCQ	SoC	350	International	Inpatient	Discontinued
ChiCTR2000030031	Deng	2	CQ	Placebo	120	China	Inpatient	Discontinued
NCT04331600	Duda-Sikula	2	CQ	SoC	400	Poland	Inpatient	Recruiting
NCT04328272	Farooq	3	HCQ	Placebo	75	Asia	Unclear	Not yet recruiting
NCT04339816	František	3	HCQ	Placebo	240	Europe	Inpatient	Recruiting
NCT04353037	Griffin	4	HCQ	Placebo	850	United States	Outpatient	Recruiting
NCT04349592	Harris	3	HCQ + Placebo	Placebo	456	Qatar	Inpatient	Not yet recruiting
ChiCTR2000029761	Huang	4	HCQ (3 arms with 3	SoC	240	China	Inpatient	Discontinued
ChiCTR2000029762	Huang	2	different dosis) HCQ	SoC	60	China	Inpatient	Discontinued
EUCTR 2020-001469-35	Jankowska	2	CQ + telemedicine	telemedicine	400	Poland	Outpatient	Recruiting
NCT04354428	Johnston	3	HCQ + Placebo	Placebo + Placebo	630	United States	Outpatient	Recruiting
NCT04307693	Kim	3	HCQ	SoC	150	Asia	Inpatient	Discontinued
2020-001366-11	Lagos	5	HCQ	SoC	10000	International	Inpatient	Recruiting
NCT04394442	Lutfy	2	HCQ	SoC	200	Saudi Arabia	Unclear	Recruiting
ChiCTR2000029837	Mao	2	CQ	Placebo	120	China	Inpatient	Discontinued
ChiCTR2000029826	Mao	2	CQ	Placebo	45	China	Inpatient	Discontinued
EUCTR 2020-001587-29	Menéndez	2	HCQ	Placebo	714	Spain	Inpatient	Recruiting

NCT04329611	Metz	2	HCQ	Placebo	1660	Canada	Inpatient	Recruiting
NCT04332991	Oldmixon	2	HCQ	Placebo	510	United States	Inpatient	Discontinued
NCT04342169	Pacchia	2	HCQ	Placebo	400	United States	Outpatient	Recruiting
NCT04353271	Richards	2	HCQ	Placebo	58	United States	Outpatient	Not yet recruiting
NCT04351191	Sarwar	4	HCQ (2arms with different dosis)	Placebo	400	Pakistan	Unclear	Recruiting
			CQ	Placebo				
NCT04346667	Sarwar	4	HCQ (2 arms with different	Placebo	400	Pakistan	Outpatient	Recruiting
			dosis) CQ	Placebo				
NCT04330586	Song	3	HCQ + Ciclesonide	Ciclesonide	141	Korea	Inpatient	Not yet recruiting
ChiCTR2000030987	Tong	3	CQ + Favipiravir	Favipiravir	150	China	Inpatient	Recruiting
EUCTR 2020-001265-36	UCD study team	3	HCQ	SoC	267	Ireland	Unclear	Recruiting
ChiCTR2000030417	Xu	2	CQ	Placebo	30	China	Inpatient	Discontinued
ChiCTR2000029740	Zhang	2	HCQ	SoC	78	China	Inpatient	Recruiting
ChiCTR2000029992	Zhenyu	3	HCQ	SoC	100	China	Inpatient	Not yet recruiting
			CQ	SoC				

^{*} Trial includes more treatment arms than reported here; target sample size refers to all arms. Abbreviations: Chloroquine (CQ), hydroxychloroquine (HCQ), standard of care (SoC). Trial marked as "International" involves centers in multiple countries.

Table S2A. Subgroup analyses for random-effects meta-analysis on mortality for treatment of COVID-19 with Hydroxychloroquine.

Subgroup	Trials (n)	Patients (n)	OR (95% CI)	P value, test for interaction	
Setting					
ICU	1	142	1.04 (0.49, 2.18)		0.99
Inpatient	19	6709	1.08 (0.98, 1.19)		
Outpatient	4	808	1.01 (0.06, 16.28)		
Published					
Yes	10	6306	1.1 (1.07, 1.13)		0.32
No	14	1353	0.96 (0.71, 1.3)		
Control					
Standard of care	15	6558	1.1 (1.01, 1.2)		0.19
Placebo	9	1101	0.88 (0.55, 1.41)		
COVID-19 diagnostic confirmation					
Confirmed	20	1862	0.94 (0.66, 1.32)		0.31
Confirmed or suspected	4	5797	1.1 (1.07, 1.13)		
Dose*					
High	2	4858	1.10 (0.96, 1.25)		0.36
Low	22	2801	0.97 (0.73, 1.30)		

^{*} High dose: \ge 1600 mg on day 1 and \ge 800 mg from day 2. Low dose: <1600 mg on day 1 or <800 from day 2.

Table S2B. Sensitivity analysis for meta-analysis for mortality for treatment of COVID-19 with Hydroxychloroquine using different methods of combination.

	Reciprocal of contrasting arm added to zero events		Trials with more than 50 participants*	Arcsine difference
	n = 24	n = 11	n = 13	n = 24
	OR (95% CI), I ² , Tau ²			ASD (95% CI), I ² , Tau ²
HKSJ- PM	1.08 (0.99, 1.18); 0, 0	1.08 (1, 1.16); 0, 0	1.08 (1, 1.17); 0, 0	0.01 (-0.01, 0.03); 0, 0
HKSJ-SJ	1.04 (0.75, 1.43); 0, 0.49	1.03 (0.9, 1.18); 0, 0.02	0.99 (0.82, 1.19); 0, 0.1	0 (-0.03, 0.03); 0, 0
MH-DSL	1.08 (0.95, 1.23); 0, 0	1.08 (0.95, 1.23); 0, 0	1.08 (0.95, 1.23); 0, 0	0.01 (-0.01, 0.03); 0, 0
Peto	1.09 (0.95, 1.23); 0, 0	1.08 (0.95, 1.23); 0, 0	1.08 (0.94, 1.22); 0, 0	0.01 (-0.01, 0.03); 0, 0

HKSJ-PM = Hartung-Knapp-Sidik-Jonkman adjustment for random effects model, Paule-Mandel estimator for tau²; HKSJ-SJ = Hartung-Knapp-Sidik-Jonkman adjustment for random effects model, Sidik-Jonkman estimator for tau²; MH-DSL = Mantel-Haenszel method for random effects model, DerSimonian-Laird estimator for tau²; PETO = Peto method with random effects model, Paule-Mandel estimator for tau²;

^{*} Zero events were corrected by adding the reciprocal of the size of the contrasting study arm

Figure S1A. Forest plot of HKSJ-SJ model. Zero events were corrected by adding the reciprocal of the size of the contrasting study arm.

Source	OR (9	95% CI)	Favours HCQ	Favours Control	Weight, %
Not Published OAHU-COVID19	16 22 10 02: 10	100 251		_	→ 0.7
ARCHAIC	16.32 [0.03; 10 15.40 [0.16; 1				→ 0.7 → 1.4
COV-HCQ	15.08 [0.01; 30	_	_		→ 1.4 → 0.5
NCT04335552 A	•	440.96]	-	_	→ 1.3
NCT04353332 A	1.21 [0.36;	4.12]		_	9.3
TEACH	1.07 [0.34;	3.38]			9.8
REMAP-CAP	1.04 [0.49;	2.18]	-		13.0
HYDRA	0.99 [0.51;	1.90]	-	_	13.7
NCT04325893	0.52 [0.19;	1.45]	_	<u> </u>	10.7
PROTECT B	0.51 [0.04;	5.76	←		4.0
NCT04335552 B	0.50 [0.01;	19.56]	←		2.0
PROTECT A	0.02 [0.00; 100	970.20]	←		→ 0.1
PATCH					0.0
PROTECT C					0.0
CCAP-1					0.0
NCT04333654					0.0
COMIHY					0.0
Random subtotal (I ² =0%)	1.03 [0.61;	1.74]	<		66.7
Published*					
Coalition I	1.20 [0.40;	3.64]		_	10.2
RECOVERY	1.10 [0.96;	1.26]		+	16.7
COVID-PEP	1.01 [0.06;	16.28]	←		3.3
NO COVID-19	0.96 [0.06;	16.22]	←		3.2
NCT04384380					0.0
ChiCTR2000029868					0.0
NCT04261517					0.0
ChiCTR2000030054					0.0
BCN PEP CoV-2 Study					0.0
ChiCTR2000029559	4 40 54 67	4.403			0.0
Random subtotal (I ² =0%)	1.10 [1.07;	1.13]			33.3
Random effects model	1.04 [0.75;	1.42]	<	>	100.0
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 0\%$, $\tau^2 = 0$			1 1 1		I
Test for overall effect: $p = 0.8$	32		0.10.2 0.5		100
			Odds	s Ratio (95% CI)	

Figure S1B. Forest plot of MH-DSL model. Zero events were corrected by adding the reciprocal of the size of the contrasting study arm.

Source	OR (95% CI)	Favours HCQ	Favours Control	Weight, %
Not Published					
OAHU-COVID19	16.32 [0.03; 10		*		→ 0.0
ARCHAIC	15.40 [0.16; 1				→ 0.1
COV-HCQ	15.08 [0.01; 30	-	-	:	→ 0.0 → 0.1
NCT04335552 A NCT04353336	4.20 [0.04; 1.21 [0.36;	4.12]			→ 0.1 1.1
TEACH	1.07 [0.34;	3.38]			1.3
REMAP-CAP	1.04 [0.49;	2.18]			3.0
HYDRA	0.99 [0.51;	1.90]		<u> </u>	3.8
NCT04325893	0.52 [0.19;	1.45]		<u>:</u>	1.6
PROTECT B	0.51 [0.04;	5.76]	←	<u>:</u>	0.3
NCT04335552 B	0.50 [0.01;	19.56]		<u>:</u>	0.1
PROTECT A	0.02 [0.00; 100	-	←		→ 0.0
PATCH					0.0
PROTECT C					0.0
CCAP-1					0.0
NCT04333654					0.0
COMIHY					0.0
Random subtotal (I ² =0%)	0.96 [0.66;	1.41]	<		11.4
Published*					
Coalition I	1.20 [0.40;	3.64]		<u>.</u>	1.4
RECOVERY	1.10 [0.96;	1.26]		+	86.8
COVID-PEP	1.01 [0.06;	16.28]	←	: :	0.2
NO COVID-19	0.96 [0.06;	16.22]	*	:	0.2
NCT04384380					0.0
ChiCTR2000029868					0.0
NCT04261517					0.0
ChiCTR2000030054					0.0
BCN PEP CoV-2 Study					0.0
ChiCTR2000029559				:	0.0
Random subtotal (I ² =0%)	1.10 [0.96;	1.26]			88.6
Random effects model	1.08 [0.95;	1.23]		: •	100.0
Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 0\%$, $\tau^2 = 0$		-			\neg
Test for overall effect: $p = 0.2$	23		0.10.2 0.5	1 2 5	100
			Odds	Ratio (95% CI)	

Figure S1C. Forest plot of Peto model. Zero events were corrected by adding the reciprocal of the size of the contrasting study arm.

Source	OR (95% CI)	Favours HCQ	Favours Contro	Weight, %
Not Published ARCHAIC COV-HCQ OAHU-COVID19 NCT04335552 A NCT04353336 TEACH REMAP-CAP HYDRA NCT04335552 B NCT04325893 PROTECT B PROTECT A PATCH PROTECT C CCAP-1	6.30 [0.36; 111.34] 5.41 [0.14; 212.73] 4.67 [0.28; 77.66] 2.74 [0.09; 82.88] 1.21 [0.36; 4.08] 1.07 [0.34; 3.35] 1.04 [0.49; 2.18] 0.99 [0.51; 1.90] 0.57 [0.02; 15.05] 0.53 [0.20; 1.41] 0.53 [0.05; 5.15] 0.15 [0.00; 6.93]	——————————————————————————————————————		→ 0.2 → 0.1 − 0.2 − 0.1 1.1 1.3 3.0 3.9 0.2 1.7 0.3 0.1 0.0 0.0 0.0
NCT04333654 COMIHY Random subtotal (I²=0%)	0.98 [0.68; 1.42]	<		0.0 0.0 12.3
Published* Coalition I RECOVERY COVID-PEP NO COVID-19 NCT04384380 ChiCTR2000029868 NCT04261517 ChiCTR2000030054 BCN PEP CoV-2 Study ChiCTR2000029559 Random subtotal (I²=0%)	1.20 [0.40; 3.62] 1.10 [0.96; 1.26] 1.01 [0.06; 16.23] 0.96 [0.06; 15.81]			1.4 85.9 0.2 0.2 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0
Random effects model Heterogeneity: $I^2 = 0\%$, $\tau^2 =$ Test for overall effect: $p = 0.2$		0.10.2 0.5 Odds	1 2 5 Ratio (95% CI)	100.0